
Meeting	Planning Committee
Date	20 April 2017
Present	Councillors Reid (Chair), Derbyshire (Vice-Chair), Boyce, Ayre, Cullwick, Cuthbertson, D'Agorne, Doughty, Funnell, Looker, Shepherd, Warters and Mercer (sub for Cllr Dew)
Apologies	Councillors Dew, Galvin and Richardson

95. Declarations of Interest

Members were asked to declare, at this point in the meeting, any personal interests, not included on the Register of Interests, or any prejudicial or disclosable pecuniary interests they may have in respect of business on the agenda.

Councillor Cullwick declared a personal interest in relation to agenda item 4a) (York St John University Playing Fields, Windmill Lane, York) as he had previously undertaken work for the University.

96. Site Visit

Application	Reason	In Attendance
York St John University Playing Fields, Windmill Lane, York (16/02358/OUTM)	To allow Members to familiarise themselves with the site and in view of objections received.	Councillors Reid, Cuthbertson, Cullwick and Shepherd

97. Minutes

Resolved: That the minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 23 March 2017 be approved and then signed by the chair as a correct record.

98. Public Participation

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme on general matters within the remit of the Planning Committee.

99. Plans List

Members considered a schedule of reports of the Assistant Director, Planning and Public Protection, relating to the following planning applications, outlining the proposals and relevant policy considerations and setting out the views of consultees and officers.

100. York St John University Playing Fields, Windmill Lane, York (16/02358/OUTM)

Members considered a major outline application by York St John University for residential development (circa 70 dwellings) with associated access and the demolition of existing buildings.

Officers circulated an update on the application in relation to the following points, with a copy of the full update republished with the online agenda:

- pooling of contributions restrictions under Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) Regulations in relation to
 - outdoor sports facilities
 - education
 - highways
- receipt of two further objections
- issues arising from site visits
 - trees to Woodlands Rehabilitation Centre
 - pre-School Nursery Places
 - air Quality monitoring
 - highway Network Management

Members questioned the following points from the Planning Officers report and update:

- details of the outdoor sports provision for that lost with the development of the site
- increase in capacity for sport at Osbaldwick Sports Club
- distance of sporting facilities to be provided from current site

- Condition 15 should refer to 'measures shall include'
- Construction Management Plan should require developer to ensure suitable parking provision for contractors is made available within the site
- Open Space and Green Infrastructure Study 2014 evidence base and ward boundary changes affecting the catchment area

John Cossam addressed the Committee and confirmed resident's use of the playing fields over a number of years. He expressed concern at the already high levels of traffic in the area which, with further development, would increase levels of nitrous oxides. He also highlighted the dangers at the Hull Road/Windmill Lane junction and requested the retention of the bollards at the top of Windmill Lane to prevent a through route.

Jane Metcalfe also spoke in objection, as a longstanding York resident. She confirmed that living in a terraced property her family were regular users of the playing fields for social purposes. She referred to a covenant restricting the use of the fields to sporting and community use and expressed concern that the replacement facilities would not be in the Hull Road area. She asked the Committee to listen to local residents and retain the open space for future generations.

Fiona Himsworth, a local resident, referred to the mental health and wellbeing of residents and the importance of access to green open space to maintain this. She highlighted the need for resident's access to the fields and woodlands on the site and pointed out that housing development would better met on existing brownfield sites. She asked Members to defer consideration of the application pending examination of alternative sites and discussions with the University regarding open space provision.

Janet O'Neill, the applicants agent, confirmed that the site was within the ownership of York St John University with formal access only required for a number of hours per week under the s106 agreement. Whilst there were no legal rights of access outside of these hours she confirmed that local residents had used the site over a number of years and confirmed that Sport England supported the arrangements for replacement facilities at Haxby Road. She also advised that the site would support the Council's need for housing and in particular affordable housing.

Cllr Neil Barnes, as one of the Ward Members, expressed concern at the proposals following resident's use of the site over a number of years and at the transfer of open space provision outside the ward. He requested deferral of the application for 6 months to allow dialogue with all concerned.

In answer to Members' further questions, Officers confirmed:-

- Current agreements required re-provision for the formal sports teams on the present site which was considered appropriate at Haxby Road
- The traffic figures detailed in the report were considered robust and were based on surveys and traffic counts
- Transport assessments had examined accident records
- Air Quality monitoring undertaken at the junction of Hull Road and Windmill Lane had shown improvements over the last 3 years

Following further lengthy discussion Councillor Looker moved and Councillor Funnell seconded a motion to defer the application in light of the issues raised and it was

Resolved: That the application be deferred to a future meeting to enable the following to take place:

- clarification to be sought on the methodology for concluding that there was no shortfall in open space provision in the area (which study, ward boundaries etc this was based on)
- clarification on the suitability of the location of the alternative open space provision
- evidence of how the existing pitches had been offered to local sports teams
- attendance of Officers from Communities and Neighbourhoods and Highways at the next meeting to answer questions

Reason: To enable further information to be provided to enable Members to make an informed decision in relation to this application.

101. Hall Farm, Strensall Road, York, YO32 9SW (16/02886/FUL)

Consideration was given to a full application by Mr Andrew Thompson for the change of use of agricultural buildings to livery stables and caravan touring pitches, including refreshment and toilet block. Members were reminded that this application had been deferred at the Committee's last meeting to allow the applicant to provide further details and justification of the very special circumstances which would outweigh the harm for development in the Green Belt.

Eamonn Keogh, the applicant's agent addressed the committee and provided the following information:

- reminded the Committee that no objections had been received from members of the public or statutory or internal consultees
- additional financial information had been provided by the applicant showing that the present business was not viable in its present form
- the development would not be visually intrusive with a small number of caravans and additional landscaping, within the existing footprint of the site

Some Member expressed support for the application with the replacement of the existing visually prominent silos and pig unit by smaller, visually less intrusive caravans and livery stables. Members recommended the retention of the existing straw bales at the site boundary whilst the landscaping became established.

Other Members referred to the damage that would be caused to the Green Belt and highlighted the speed of vehicles on the adjacent road. They also felt that the very special circumstances required for development within the Green Belt had not been provided.

Officers reiterated that, the information provided by the applicant was in not, in their opinion, sufficient to outweigh the harm identified to the character and visual amenity provided by the rural landscape. They highlighted policies in the National Planning Policy Framework guidance relating to protection of the Green Belt which showed that the very special circumstances necessary, to justify the development, did not exist in this case.

Councillor Ayre then moved and Councillor Cuthbertson seconded refusal of the application on the grounds set out in the Officers report and on being put to the vote, the motion was lost.

Following further discussion, Councillor Reid moved and Councillor Cullwick seconded deferral of the application to allow the applicant to provide further information on the very special circumstances they considered relevant which would allow development in the Green Belt.

Resolved: That the application be deferred to allow Officers to request additional information from the applicants on the following points:

- What alternative proposals for diversification to appropriate development in the green belt had been investigated and discounted
- How the proposal would be viable and ensure that the residual farming operation could continue at the site.

Reason: To allow the applicant to provide the additional information, to further inform Members prior to a decision being taken on the application.

Cllr A Reid, Chair

[The meeting started at 4.30 pm and finished at 6.40 pm].